

# Alan Bates and Others v Post Office Limited

## INDEX to proceedings

### Alan Bates and Others v Post Office Limited

TLQ17/0455

Before Mr Justice Fraser

Court 26, Rolls Building, Fetter Lane, London

11 March 2019 – 2 July 2019; 16 December 2019

Please cite this transcript as:

*Alan Bates v Post Office Limited*, TLQ17/0455, Before Mr Justice Fraser, 11 March 2019 – 2 July 2019; 16 December 2019, Supplement, 18 *Digital Evidence and Electronic Signature Law Review* (2021)

### Index to transcript of trial

*Editorial notes:*

(i) *The transcript by Opus 2 International numbers the transcripts of the trial in a different way to the actual way in which the trial unfolded. This means there are four separate, albeit related, transcripts associated with Day 12.*

(ii) *Interspersed in this index are judgments that have been published, together the URL for each judgment, and reference to two judgments of Coulson LJ and a hearing in the Crown Court at Southwark before Her Honour Judge Taylor. The latter three documents are published under 'Case Judgments' in the main body of the journal.*

Claimants' Written Opening

Defendant's Written Opening

Day 1: 11 March 2019

Housekeeping, 1 – 8

Opening speech for the claimants, by Patrick Green QC, 8 – 78

Opening speech for the defendants, Anthony de Garr Robinson QC, 79 – 165

Day 2: 12 March 2019

Examination in Chief of Mr Adrees Latif, 1 – 2

Cross examination of Mr Andrees Latif, 2 – 94

Re-examination of Mr Andrees Latif, 94 – 97

Questions from the judge, 97 – 98

Examination in Chief of Mr Jayesh Tank, 99 – 100

Cross examination of Mr Jayesh Tank, 101 – 149

Warning against self-incrimination given to Mr Jayesh Tank by the judge, 149 – 150

Continuation of cross examination of Mr Jayesh Tank, 150 – 157

Re-examination of Mr Jayesh Tank, 157 – 161

Examination in Chief of Mr Anup Patny, 162 – 163

Cross examination of Mr Anup Patny, 163 – 181

Housekeeping, 182 – 185

Day 3: 13 March 2019

Housekeeping, 1 – 7

Examination in Chief of Mr Aakash Patny, 8 – 9

Cross examination of Mr Aakash Patny, 9 – 58

Re-examination of Mr Aakash Patny, 58 – 63

Questions from the judge, 63 – 66

Examination in Chief of Mrs Angela Burke, 66 – 67

Cross examination of Mrs Angela Burke, 68 – 104

Re-examination of Mrs Angela Burke, 104

Housekeeping, 104 – 196

Examination in Chief of Mr Richard Roll, 106 – 107

Cross examination of Mr Richard Roll, 107 – 181

Housekeeping, 181 – 184

**Day 4: 14 March 2019**

Cross examination of Mr Richard Roll, 1 – 159

Re-examination of Mr Richard Roll, 160 – 164

Examination in Chief of Mr Ian Henderson, 165

Cross examination of Mr Ian Henderson, 166 – 182

Questions from the judge, 183 – 186

Re-examination of Mr Ian Henderson, 186 – 187

Housekeeping, 187 – 190

Order, 191 – 191

Housekeeping, 192 – 200

**Day 5: 18 March 2019**

Housekeeping, 1 – 4

Order, 5 – 8

Examination in Chief of Ms Angela van den Bogerd, 8

Cross examination of Ms Angela van den Bogerd, 9 – 189

Housekeeping, 189 – 197

**Day 6: 19 March 2019**

Housekeeping, 1 – 5

Cross examination of Ms Angela van den Bogerd, 5 – 78

Re-examination of Ms Angela van den Bogerd, 79 – 106

Questions from the judge, 106 – 111

Further re-examination of Ms Angela van den

Bogerd, 111 – 112

Examination-in-chief of Ms Dawn Phillips, 113

Cross-examination of Ms Dawn Phillips, 114 – 144

Re-examination of Ms Dawn Phillips, 145

Questions from the judge, 145 – 147

Examination-in-chief of Mrs Tracy Mather, 148 – 149

Cross-examination of Mrs Tracy Mather, 150 – 170

Re-examination of Mrs Tracy Mather, 170 – 171

Questions from the judge, 171 – 175

Examination-in-chief of Mr Paul Smith, 175 – 176

Cross-examination of Mr Paul Smith, 176 – 194

Questions from the judge, 194 – 197

Housekeeping, 198 – 199

**Day 7: 20 March 2019**

Housekeeping, 1 – 3

Examination-in-chief of Mr David Malcolm Robinson, 3 – 5

Cross-examination of Mr David Malcolm Robinson, 5 – 23

Re-examination of Mr David Malcolm Robinson, 24 – 26

Questions from the judge, 26 – 27

Re-examination of Mr David Malcolm Robinson, 26 – 27

Examination-in-chief of Mr Andrew Paul Dunks, 27 – 28

Cross-examination of Mr Andrew Paul Dunks, 28 – 71

Re-examination of Mr Andrew Paul Dunks, 72 – 73

Questions from the judge, 73

Examination-in-chief of Mr Torstein Olav Godeseth, 74 – 81

Cross-examination of Mr Torstein Olav Godeseth, 81 – 192

Housekeeping, 192 – 193

Day 8: 21 March 2019

Cross-examination of Mr Torstein Olav Godeseth, 1 – 88

Recusal application received, 89 – 94

Cross-examination of Mr Torstein Olav Godeseth, 95 – 105

Re-examination of Mr Torstein Olav Godeseth, 106 – 114

Questions from the judge, 115 – 123

Procedural matter regarding recusal application, 124 – 144

Housekeeping, 145 – 146

Day 1A: 3 April 2019 Application by the Post Office Limited for the judge to recuse himself

Housekeeping, 1

Application, 2 – 110

Submissions by claimants, 110 – 179

Reply, 180 – 194

Point of clarification, 194 – 196

Housekeeping, 196 – 198

9 April 2019, Judgment by Fraser J on recusal: *Bates v Post Office Ltd (No.4: Recusal Application)* [2019] EWHC 871 (QB), <https://www.bailii.org/ew/cases/EWHC/QB/2019/871.html>

Day 12: 11 April 2019

Numbering of transcripts, 1

Examination-in-chief of Mr Stephen Paul Parker, 2 – 8

Cross-examination of Mr Stephen Paul Parker, 9 – 91

Re-examination of Mr Stephen Paul Parker, 91 – 95

Questions from the judge, 95 – 97

Housekeeping and orders, 98 – 134

9 May 2019, Judgment by Coulson LJ on the application by the Post Office Limited to appeal the recusal decision, reference A1/2019/0855

Please cite as follows:

*Bates v Post Office Ltd (No.4: Recusal Application)* Judgment by Coulson LJ on the application by the Post Office Limited to appeal the recusal decision, 9 May 2019 (A1/2019/0855), Court of Appeal, not reported, Supplement, 18 *Digital Evidence and Electronic Signature Law Review* (2021) <https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/5363>

Day 14: 4 June 2019

Housekeeping, 1 – 5

Examination-in-chief of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 5 – 7

Cross-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 7 – 195

Day 15: 5 June 2019

Housekeeping, 1

Legal point, 148 – 151

Legal point continued in the absence of the witness, 151 – 153

Cross-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 153 – 190

Housekeeping (including discussion of the numbering of day of the trial), 190 – 193

Day 16: 6 June 2019

Cross-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 1 – 100

Housekeeping, 101 – 102

Cross-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 102 – 200

Day 17: 7 June 2019

Housekeeping, 1

Cross-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 2 – 161

Re-examination of Mr Jason Peter Coyne, 162 – 183

Housekeeping, 184 – 191

Day 18: 11 June 2019

Housekeeping (numbering of days), 1

Examination-in-chief of Dr Robert Peel Worden, 1 – 6

Point raised by the judge, 6 – 8

Cross-examination of Dr Robert Peel Worden,  
8 – 198

Housekeeping, 198 – 200

Day 19: 13 June 2019

Housekeeping, 1 – 2

Cross-examination of Dr Robert Peel Worden,  
3 – 197

Housekeeping, 198 – 207

Day 20: 14 June 2019

Housekeeping, 1

Cross-examination of Dr Robert Peel Worden,  
2 – 163

Re-examination of Dr Robert Peel Worden,  
164 – 186

Questions from the judge, 187 – 190

Housekeeping, 191 – 194

Day 21: 1 July 2019

Closing submissions by Patrick Green QC, 1 –  
164

Day 22: 2 July 2019

Closing submissions by Anthony de Garr  
Robinson QC, 1 – 145

Housekeeping, 146 – 161

23 October 2019, Further Issues – Costs Management  
Conference

22 November 2019, Approved Judgment on  
application by the Post Office Limited to appeal  
against the decision in *Bates v Post Office Ltd ((No 3)  
Common Issues* [2019] EWHC 606 (QB), before  
Coulson LJ, Case No A1/2019/1387/PTA

Please cite as follows:

*Bates v Post Office Ltd ((No 3) Common  
Issues)* Judgment by Coulson LJ on the  
application by the Post Office Limited  
to appeal against the decision in *Bates  
v Post Office Ltd ((No 3) Common  
Issues* [2019] EWHC 606 (QB), (Case  
No A1/2019/1387/PTA), Supplement,  
18 *Digital Evidence and Electronic  
Signature Law Review* (2021)

[https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/  
view/5365](https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/5365)

16 December 2019 Approved handing down of  
Judgment by Fraser J, No. QB-2016-004710

Please cite this transcript as follows:

*Bates v The Post Office Ltd (No 6: Horizon  
Issues) Rev 1* 16 December 2019 Approved  
handing down of Judgment by Fraser J, No.  
QB-2016-004710, Supplement, 18 *Digital  
Evidence and Electronic Signature Law Review*  
(2021)

[https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/  
5364](https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/5364)

11 December 2020, *R v Trousdale* A20200057 in the  
Crown Court at Southwark before Her Honour Judge  
Taylor

Please cite this transcript as follows:

*R v Trousdale* A20200057 in the Crown Court  
at Southwark before Her Honour Judge Taylor,  
Supplement, 18 *Digital Evidence and  
Electronic Signature Law Review* (2021)

[https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/  
5366](https://journals.sas.ac.uk/deeslr/article/view/5366)